arXiv:1511.06758v2 [math.GR] 24 Nov 2015

A NOTE ON NONABELIAN FREIMAN-RUZSA

SEAN EBERHARD

Abstract. Recently Breuillard and Tointon [BT] showed that one reasonable formulation of the polynomial Freiman-Ruzsa conjecture fails for nonabelian groups. We improve and simplify their construction.

1. Introduction

A subset A of some ambient group G is called a *K-approximate group* if $A^2 \subset XA$ for some set X of size at most K. A Freiman-type structure theorem for approximate groups was proved by Breuillard, Green, and Tao [BGT12].

Theorem 1.1 (Breuillard-Green-Tao [BGT12])**.** *Let A be a K-approximate group. Then there is a coset nilprogression $P \subset A^{100}$ of rank and step $O_K(1)$ such that A is covered by $O_K(1)$ translates of P.*

The former $O_K(1)$ is benign: it can be taken to be $O(K^2 \log K)$, or even $O(\log K)$ at the expense of replacing A^{100} in the theorem by $A^{O_K(1)}$. No earthly bounds are known for the latter $O_K(1)$, however, nor for the $O_K(1)$ in the following weaker statement.

Corollary 1.2. *Every K-approximate group A is contained in $O_K(1)$ cosets of a group Γ having a normal subgroup $H \subset A^{100}$ such that Γ/H is nilpotent.*

Recently Breuillard and Tointon [BT] gave an example which shows that the $O_K(1)$ here cannot be taken to be polynomial in K, even if we were to replace "nilpotent" with "solvable" and A^{100} with, say, $A^{\exp\exp\exp K}$.

Theorem 1.3 (Breuillard-Tointon [BT])**.** *Let $f : \mathbf{N} \to \mathbf{N}$ be arbitrary. Then for arbitrarily large K there are finite K-approximate groups A not covered by $K^{\frac{1}{200}\log\log\log\log K}$ cosets of any group Γ having a finite normal subgroup $H \subset A^{f(K)}$ such that Γ/H is solvable.*

Here we improve and simplify their construction.

Theorem 1.4. *For arbitrarily large K there are finite K-approximate groups A not covered by $K^{\log\log K}$ cosets of any group Γ having a finite normal subgroup H such that Γ/H is solvable.*

2. Finite-by-solvable groups

If $\mathcal{P}$ and $\mathcal{Q}$ are adjectives pertaining to groups (e.g., finite, nilpotent, or solvable), then a group G is called $\mathcal{P}$-by-$\mathcal{Q}$ if it fits into an exact sequence

$$1 \to P \to G \to Q \to 1$$

in which P is a $\mathcal{P}$ group and Q is a $\mathcal{Q}$ group. (Some authors would call such a group $\mathcal{Q}$-by-$\mathcal{P}$. Perhaps they have the logical right of it, but we'll stick to the more common convention.)

Thus a group Γ as in Theorem 1.4 having a finite normal subgroup H such that Γ/H is solvable is called finite-by-solvable. Every finite-by-solvable group is solvable-by-finite, but the converse does not hold. For example consider the group $G = \mathcal{S}_n \ltimes \mathbf{Z}^n$, where $\mathcal{S}_n$ acts on $\mathbf{Z}^n$ by permuting coordinates. G is obviously solvable-by-finite, even abelian-by-finite, but the following lemma shows that G is not finite-by-solvable.

Lemma 2.1. *If $G \leqslant \mathcal{S}_n$ is not solvable then $G \ltimes \mathbf{Z}^n$ is not finite-by-solvable.*

Proof. Let H be a normal subgroup of $G \ltimes \mathbf{Z}^n$ such that $(G \ltimes \mathbf{Z}^n)/H$ is solvable. Since $G/(H \cap G) \cong (GH)/H \leqslant (G \ltimes \mathbf{Z}^n)/H$ we must have $G/(H \cap G)$ solvable, and in particular $H \cap G \neq 1$. Moreover since H is normal we must have $H \supset [H \cap G, \mathbf{Z}^n]$. But since $H \cap G \neq 1$ and the action of $\mathcal{S}_n$ on $\mathbf{Z}^n$ is faithful the subgroup $[H \cap G, \mathbf{Z}^n]$ of $\mathbf{Z}^n$ is nontrivial and therefore infinite, so H must be infinite. □

We can now briefly sketch the proof of Theorem 1.4. We will take $G = \mathcal{S}_n \ltimes \mathbf{Z}^n$ and $A = \mathcal{S}_n \ltimes [-R, R]^n$, where $R \approx \infty$. Then A is a 2^n-approximate group. We will show that any $\Gamma \leqslant G$ which covers A with only $2^{n \log n}$ cosets must cover so much of $\mathcal{S}_n$ that $\Gamma \cap \mathcal{S}_n$ is not solvable. Γ will also have to cover a finite-index subgroup of $\mathbf{Z}^n$, so from Lemma 2.1 it will follow that Γ is not finite-by-solvable.

3. Solvable subgroups of the symmetric group

The following theorem about solvable subgroups of symmetric group was proved by Dixon [Dix67].

Theorem 3.1. *If $G \leqslant \mathcal{S}_n$ is solvable then $|G| \leqslant (2 \cdot 3^{1/3})^{n-1}$.*

For comparison, Dixon also proved that if $G \leqslant \mathcal{S}_n$ is abelian then $|G| \leqslant (3^{1/3})^n$, while if $G \leqslant \mathcal{S}_n$ is nilpotent then $|G| \leqslant 2^{n-1}$: see Dixon [Dix67, Dix71]. Each of these theorems is sharp up to a small multiplicative factor.

We reproduce the proof of Theorem 3.1 here just to keep this note reasonably self-contained.

Proof. Let $a = 2 \cdot 3^{1/3}$. We will prove $|G| \leqslant a^{n-1}$ by induction on n.

If G is intransitive, say with orbit sizes $n_1, \dots, n_m$ for some $m > 1$, then $G \leqslant G_1 \times \cdots \times G_m$, where $G_i \leqslant \mathcal{S}_{n_i}$ is the restriction of G to the ith orbit. Since each restriction G_i is solvable, by induction

$$|G| \leqslant a^{n_1 - 1} \cdots a^{n_m - 1} \leqslant a^{n-1}.$$

Similarly if G is transitive but imprimitive, say preserving a system of r blocks with $1 < r < n$, then the subgroup $H \leqslant G$ fixing each block is a solvable subgroup of $\mathcal{S}_{n/r}^r$, and G/H is a solvable subgroup of $\mathcal{S}_r$, so by induction

$$|G| = |G/H|\,|H| \leqslant a^{r-1}(a^{n/r-1})^r = a^{n-1}.$$

Hence we may assume G is primitive. Let $A \leqslant G$ be a minimal normal subgroup. Then A is characteristically simple (has no proper nontrivial characteristic subgroups), and any characteristically simple finite group is a direct product of isomorphic simple groups. Since G is solvable this implies that $A \cong \mathbf{F}_p^k$ for some prime p and some $k \geqslant 1$. Let G_1 be the stabilizer of a point in G. Since G is primitive G_1 is maximal. Since G is transitive G_1 contains no nontrivial normal subgroup of G, so $G = G_1A$. The centralizer $C(A)$ of A in G is normal in G, so $C(A) \cap G_1$ is normalised by both A and G_1, hence by G. Thus $C(A) \cap G_1 = 1$. Thus $C(A) = A$ and $n = [G : G_1] = |A| = p^k$. It now follows that $G_1 \cong G/C(A)$, which is isomorphic to a subgroup of $\mathrm{Aut}(A) \cong \mathrm{GL}_k(\mathbf{F}_p)$, so

$$|G| \leqslant p^k |\,\mathrm{GL}_k(\mathbf{F}_p)| = p^k(p^k-1)(p^k-p)\cdots(p^k-p^{k-1}).$$

Now check this is at most a^{p^k-1} for all p, k. □

4. Main argument

Let $n \geqslant 100$, and let $G = \mathcal{S}_n \ltimes \mathbf{Z}^n$, where $\mathcal{S}_n$ acts on $\mathbf{Z}^n$ by permuting coordinates. For $r \geqslant 0$ let A_r be the ball

$$A_r = \mathcal{S}_n \ltimes [-r, r]^n.$$

Since $A_r^2 \subset A_{2r}$, A_r is a 2^n-approximate group for every r. Fix $R > 2^{n \log n}$ and let $A = A_R$.

Suppose A is contained in $2^{n \log n}$ cosets of $\Gamma \leqslant G$, i.e., $|A\Gamma/\Gamma| \leqslant 2^{n \log n}$. Then since $2^{n \log n} < R$ there is some integer $r \leqslant R$ such that $|A_{r+1}\Gamma/\Gamma| = |A_r\Gamma/\Gamma|$. Since $A_{s+1} = A_1A_s$ for all $s \geqslant 0$ this implies that $A_s\Gamma = A_r\Gamma$ for all $s \geqslant r$, and hence $A_r\Gamma = G$ and $A\Gamma = G$. Thus Γ has index at most $2^{n \log n}$ in G.

In particular $\Gamma \cap \mathcal{S}_n$ has index at most $2^{n \log n}$ in $\mathcal{S}_n$, so by Theorem 3.1 and the calculation

$$2^{n \log n}(2 \cdot 3^{1/3})^n < n!$$

we know that $\Gamma \cap \mathcal{S}_n$ is not solvable. Also $\Gamma \cap \mathbf{Z}^n$ is a finite-index subgroup of $\mathbf{Z}^n$, so $\Gamma \cap \mathbf{Z}^n \geqslant d\mathbf{Z}^n$ for some integer $d > 0$. Thus Γ contains

$$(\Gamma \cap \mathcal{S}_n) \ltimes d\mathbf{Z}^n \cong (\Gamma \cap \mathcal{S}_n) \ltimes \mathbf{Z}^n,$$

so by Lemma 2.1 the group Γ cannot be finite-by-solvable.

References

[BGT12] Emmanuel Breuillard, Ben Green, and Terence Tao. The structure of approximate groups. *Publ. Math. Inst. Hautes Études Sci.*, 116:115–221, 2012.

[BT] Emmanuel Breuillard and Matthew C. H. Tointon. Nilprogressions and groups with moderate growth. preprint.

[Dix67] John D. Dixon. The Fitting subgroup of a linear solvable group. *J. Austral. Math. Soc.*, 7:417–424, 1967.

[Dix71] John D. Dixon. Maximal abelian subgroups of the symmetric groups. *Canad. J. Math.*, 23:426–438, 1971.

Mathematical Institute, University of Oxford, UK
E-mail address: eberhard@maths.ox.ac.uk